

Defining “public benefit” when considering whether or not to assign a removal fee when a parking meter is permanently removed.

Draft: Current 012914

DDA Approach to Reviewing Plans for Impacts to On-street Parking:

On March 4th, 2009 the DDA Board passed a policy regarding removal of on-street public parking spaces (paraphrased from the March 4, 2009 Resolution):

1. *Resist efforts to permanently remove an on-street parking meter space unless a compelling broad community benefit can be established. It is not enough that the removal of a public parking space benefit a project – there must be a larger, community benefit.*

In support of this element, DDA staff will first encourage applicants to re-work the elements of their project that impact on-street meter parking. If this is not possible, DDA staff will work with City staff to review the proposed changes for community benefit.

2. *In instances where an on-street meter removal does not benefit the Ann Arbor community, assess the cost to replace this public parking space in a future downtown public parking structure. This cost is currently valued at \$45,000/parking meter space.*

The following outlines an approach to create consistency with what the DDA defines as “community benefit”

First and foremost, elements impacting meter removal or relocation must benefit the broader community and not simply the project or property owner requesting a change.

Broad Community Benefit may include:

- Elements that meet or exceed goals in the DDA Development Plan, including District economic development or reinforces quality of place.
- Elements that meet or exceed goals in approved city plans and goals, including stormwater, non-motorized, and urban forestry.
 - To assess this, DDA staff will work closely with the City staff that implement these plans, ensure that the recommendations do in fact meet established goals, and that the suggested removal of parking meters is the only way to achieve the stated goal.
- In some cases, elements that meet or exceed recognized best practices may be compelling enough to be recognized as a community benefit, even if not explicitly conveyed in an approved plan
 - To assess this, DDA staff will work closely with the City staff that implement these best practices, ensure that the recommendations do in fact go above

Defining “public benefit” when considering whether or not to assign a removal fee when a parking meter is permanently removed.

Draft: Current 012914

and beyond, and that the suggested removal of parking meters is the only way to achieve the stated benefit.

- Meter removals for public transportation (bus stops), City projects, and DDA projects.

Broad Community Benefit does not include:

- Elements that benefit only the project or property owner
 - This may include elements such as loading zones and curb cuts that serve only the proposed development. While loading zones may mitigate potential traffic issues, they mitigate the issue caused by the development and are not a public benefit in and of themselves. The same can be said for curb cuts to allow for trash service, etc.
- Elements that are in conflict with approved city plans, policy, best practice, and code

In considering community benefit, DDA staff must weigh the location and number of spaces impacted.

Questions to ask and weigh in review:

- Who is served by the meter relocation/impact? (project site/property owner or the broader community?)
- Do the elements impacting meters meet specific recommendations or goals outlined in DDA or City approved plans?
 - Is the proposed element, its location, and meter removal the only way to accomplish this goal? Could the impacting element be relocated and still accomplish an established goal without impacting on-street meters?
- Do the elements impacting meters align with best practice according to DDA and City staff?
- How significant is the impact to on-street meters? Does removal have a negative impact on surrounding business, residents, and overall accessibility?

Meters removed permanently as of 2013

<i>Date of Removal</i>	<i>Block #</i>	<i>Street Name</i>	<i># of spaces removed</i>	<i>Reason removed</i>
<i>Anticipated</i>		Nielsen Court Extension	5	UM Parking Structure and Court Extension - request
<i>Anticipated</i>	500	Thompson Street	4	UM Munger Graduate Hall - request
<i>Anticipated</i>	600	E. Madison Street	2	South Quad - request
<i>Anticipated</i>		State Street	1	Schembechler Hall

Summer 2013	400	E. Washington St	4	Varsity Residential Building
Winter 2013	Lot 16	Community High lot	3	Zingermans contract with Community High to rent 3 spaces permanently
Winter 2013		Library Lane	1	created an additional Zip Car space
Fall 2012	1000	Wall Street	1	U of M construction
Fall 2012	400	Thompson	1	U of M construction - driveway
Fall 2012	200	E Liberty	3	Federal Building - removal requested by Federal Marshalls
Fall 2012	800	Mary	1	TCO requesting removal of space (dumpster)
Summer 2012	200	E Ann	1	Loading zone installed (complaints re: trucks in the alley)
Summer 2012	300	E Washington	1	UM Credit Union - install new fire hydrant
Summer 2012	1300	S University	3	Landmark. Also, loading zone was removed
2011	200	W Washington	2	Mark's Carts
2011	300	E Huron	21	Justice Center Remodel
2010	800	E Washington	1	U of M, North Quad construction
2009	300	E Ann	13	City employee parking/reverse angle parking
2009	Lot 11	4th and Catherine Lot	2	Zip car spaces
2009	Lot 9	City Hall	17	Municipal Center
2009	700	S State	1	UM - fire hydrant installation
2009	Lot 6	Main and Ann Lot	1	Creating a van-accessible space
2009	Lot 3	Palio Lot	1	Creating a van-accessible space
2009	300	Observatory	1	U of M driveway
Fall 2007	600	E University	1	Zaragon Place driveway
2007	100	Observatory	9	U of M construction - block no longer has metered parking
2007	1200	E Ann	3	U of M Construction
2007	1300	E Ann	16	U of M Construction - Hospital entrance
2006	100	Zina Pitcher	4	Bus Stop
2006	400	Thompson	1	Bus Stop
prior to 2006	200	Observatory	1	
prior to 2006	600	Monroe	2	U of M request
prior to 2006	700	N University	2	created a loading zone
prior to 2006	700	N University	6	U of M
prior to 2006	300	S Ashley	1	
prior to 2006	500	S Ashley	3	
prior to 2006	600	E Liberty	1	
prior to 2006	300	Maynard	6	2 way traffic conversion
prior to 2006	300	Hoover	2	U of M

Meters removed permanently as of 2013

prior to 2006	800	N University	8	U of M Hill Auditorium area converted to no parking
prior to 2006	300	S State	6	2 way traffic conversion
prior to 2006	400/500	S State	3	U of M taxi stand (MI Union)
prior to 2006	1100	E Ann	12	U of M Parking Structure - block no longer has onstreet parking
prior to 2006	500	Thompson	1	U of M Structure Entrance
prior to 2006	600	E University	2	U of M no parking area designated
prior to 2006	700	E University	1	U of M request
prior to 2006	100	E Ann	2	Courthouse 15 min parking
prior to 2006	200	E Ann	1	Hands on Museum staging area for school buses
prior to 2006	300	E Ann	1	
prior to 2006	400	S State	3	Taxi stand and crosswalk
prior to 2006	600	E Liberty	2	
prior to 2006	600	E William	1	Loading zone
prior to 2006	1200	S University	1	
prior to 2006	600	Forest	7	Forest Parking Structure construction
prior to 2006	Lot 11	4th and Catherine Lot	1	Creating a van accessible handicap space

Total eliminated	189
Current Request	<u>12</u>
New total	201