

## Memo

To: John Hieftje, Mayor; Stephen Powers, City Administrator  
Re: Public Art Task Force findings, recommendations and concerns  
From: Sabra Briere, member of City Council  
Date: March 16, 2013

The Public Art Task force has met nine times since it was appointed. The first four meetings were primarily fact finding – How is public art administered? How do other communities fund art in public places? What types of activities are supported by what types of funding? What doesn't work with the current ordinance? What types of changes would bring about the outcomes we want?

The draft ordinance is a reflection of those discussions.

Members of the task force are aware that the Council expected a report on February 19<sup>th</sup>. The City Attorney's office has been working closely with the staff to make recommendations to the task force[].

**Findings:** Although there isn't only one successful model that the City could follow, there are many communities with successful public art programs. In those cities where public art is funded, in part, by a percent for art funding mechanism, those funds are limited and restricted. The funds based on capital improvements don't accumulate quickly. Many communities use the percent for art mechanism as only one part of their entire funding mechanism for art in public places.

Community acceptance and enthusiasm for public art grows in those communities where the selection and funding for art are part of a larger community process. Engaging the community in the selection and funding of some art in public places provides for a larger discussion of art and its place in the public arena. The task force heard that having some art projects arise from the community (in much the same way the Water Hill Music Festival and the Skatepark have arisen) enriches the entire process.

**Recommendation:** The City should encourage an outside organization to solicit funds for specific community-generated public art projects. These funds could then be contributed to the City and placed in a dedicated fund for public art.

**Findings:** Public Art programs, however they are funded, rely heavily on professional staff. This reliance increases if the expectation is that public (tax) dollars will be used to provide public art built in connection with capital improvement projects. The amount of lead time required to discuss art as part of a project, include it in an RFP, and evaluate any and all proposals for their responsiveness to community visions can be significant. In addition to any administrative functions, a public art professional is often expected to help raise public awareness, collaborate in the design of projects with representatives from other governmental units as well as other municipalities, and to work closely with both artists and the public.

**Recommendation:** a professionally trained public art administrator can provide this level of support, but needs to be employed more than 50% of the time. The Public Art Task Force agrees that the program would benefit from the services of a trained administrator, either as a contract employee or a direct hire.

**Findings:** Pooled percent for art funds place an unanticipated burden on systems planning and financial staff to effectively account for each funding stream. A limited percent, available for only a portion of all capital improvements where the art is 'baked in' may not provide sufficient funding to either enhance the architecture or add visible and notable art.

**Recommendations:** Eliminate pooled funding, and remove any reference to a specific percentage of a project budget for art. Instead, staff should work to determine whether a specific capital improvement project should have enhanced design features – including either enhanced architectural work or specific public art. The funding for any enhanced design elements should be included in the budget for the project, and the need to include either enhanced architectural design features or public art selection and installation should become part of the RFP process.

**Recommendations:** The staff should review the successful implementation of any changes in the ordinance after 36 months. This timing is based on the task force’s awareness that capital improvements may take longer than two years to move from inception to completion.

**Concerns:** Some task force members voiced a concern that, if each project that includes enhanced architectural design or public art needs to be approved by Council, future Councils may not honor the consensus position that some public dollars can be used to enhance Ann Arbor’s public spaces. The task force did not determine a solution to this concern.

**Concerns:** Some task force members believe that the best funding mechanism remains a millage for art. The task force requests that this concept not be permanently shelved.

The task force will meet on Thursday, March 28. I anticipate that the Council will see recommendations at the second Council meeting in April (April 15).

## Chapter 8: Organization of Boards and Commissions

### 1:238. - Ann Arbor Public Art Commission.

- (1) *Intent.* The Ann Arbor Public Art Commission is established to serve as the oversight body provided for in [Chapter 24](#), the Public Art Ordinance.
- (2) *General.*
  - (A) The Ann Arbor Public Art Commission shall consist of 9 members nominated by the Mayor and approved by City Council. Members shall serve for 3-year terms. In making appointments of members of the Ann Arbor Public Art Commission, the Mayor and City Council shall appoint persons who, insofar as possible, have experience and/or an interest in the placement, creation, curation or design of public art. The terms of office of the first Ann Arbor Public Art Commission members appointed hereunder shall be fixed by the Mayor and City Council so that the terms of 3 members will be for 1 year, 3 members will be for 2 years, and 3 will be for 3 years. After the initial Commission is formed, all members thereafter will be appointed for no more than two (2) consecutive 3-year terms.
  - (B) The City Administrator or her/his designee shall be a nonvoting ex-officio member of the Commission and provide adequate support staffing to the Commission.
  - (C) The Ann Arbor Public Art Commission may establish subcommittees, as appropriate, to assist it relative to its powers and duties under the provisions of [Chapter 24](#), provided, that all recommendations to the City Council shall be made by the Commission and not by a subcommittee of the Commission. The Commission may, by majority vote of the members, appoint persons who are not members of the Ann Arbor Public Art Commission to be non-voting members of such subcommittees.
- (3) *Powers and duties.* The Ann Arbor Public Art Commission shall have the powers and duties as set forth more specifically in [Chapter 24](#)

## Chapter 24: Public Art

### 1:830. - Title.

This chapter shall be known as the Public Art Ordinance of the City of Ann Arbor.

(Ord. No. 47-07, § 2, 11-5-07)

### 1:831. - Intent and Purpose.

The State of Michigan has recognized, through the enactment of The Faxon-McNamee Art in Public Places Act (MCL 18.71 et seq.), the importance of promoting art in government spaces and facilities. City Council has determined that the creation of public art will improve the aesthetic quality of public spaces and structures, provide cultural and recreational opportunities, contribute to the local heritage, stimulate economic activity and promote the general welfare of the community. City Council recognizes the role that government can play and the support that government can offer to foster the development of culture and the arts.

Funding for public art may come from private donations of cash or collateral (specific objects of art), crowdfunding for specific art projects, as part of a capital improvement project specifically designated as an enhanced project, or other funds that City Council may appropriate.

(Ord. No. 47-07, § 2, 11-5-07)

### 1:832. - Definitions.

The following words are defined for purposes of this chapter.

*Architectural enhancement* means the skilled application of artistic elements to the physical embellishment of the publicly visible features of a public project, which may include the placement of works of art, or specially designed plazas, atriums, or other public spaces.

*Capital improvement project* means any construction or renovation of any public space or facility. Capital improvement projects may include, but are not limited to gateway and signature streets, street vistas (including dead ends, roundabouts, and "T" intersections), street medians, sidewalks and sidewalk ramps, street furniture, street lights, manhole covers, tree grates, fence railings, paving, water features, bridges, overpasses, parks, squares, plazas, parking structures, signs, and public buildings and building lobbies.

*Construction costs* means all costs necessary to complete a capital improvement project, excluding costs allocated for:

- (1) the acquisition of real property;
- (2) soil remediation;

Ca 3/14/13 2:28 PM

Deleted: P

Ca 3/14/13 2:28 PM

Deleted: A

Ca 3/13/13 1:21 PM

Deleted: the Art in Public Places Trust FundAnn Arbor Public Art Fund (as defined in section 1:834),

Ca 3/13/13 12:36 PM

Deleted: building

Ca 3/13/13 12:36 PM

Deleted: ,

- (3) demolition;
- (4) the issuance of debt;
- (5) permits and administrative fees;
- (6) fixtures, equipment and furnishings;
- (7) contingencies.

*Crowdfunding* means a form of fundraising for a specific purpose, using media as a means of reaching prospective donors, and using those donations to provide some or all of the funds to design, build and maintain public art.

*Enhanced project* means a capital improvement project that includes public art.

*Public art* means both temporary and permanent works of art created, purchased, produced or otherwise acquired for display on or in public spaces or facilities. Public art means the product of a skilled artist (or group of artists) and includes, but is not limited to, architectural enhancements, material aesthetic design elements, special landscape treatments, paintings, sculpture, engravings, murals, mobiles, photographs, drawings and works in fabric.

(Ord. No. 47-07, § 2, 11-5-07; Ord. No. 11-23, § 1, 12-5-11)

### 1:833 – Capital improvement project planning

- (1) The City Administrator shall work with the Public Art Commission to develop written criteria by which City staff shall evaluate whether a capital improvement project should be designated as an enhanced project. Upon completion and/or subsequent modification, these written criteria shall be transmitted to City Council.
  
- (2) Where City staff determines that a capital improvement project should be designated as an enhanced project, staff shall identify the capital improvement project as an enhanced project in the budget and shall identify that portion of the project budget attributable to public art.
  
- (3) Where City staff determines that an enhanced project should include public art as part of the design of the project (such as architectural enhancements or material aesthetic design elements), such public art shall, as appropriate, be solicited at the design stage and included in any relevant RFQs, RFPs, or contracts for design of the enhanced project. To the extent possible, the completed design of the enhanced project showing the public art elements shall be transmitted to City Council prior to City Council's consideration of any contract to construct or produce the enhanced project or public art elements.

Ca 3/14/13 2:16 PM

**Deleted:** *Initial project estimate* means the amount calculated as the construction costs for a capital improvement project at the time the project is first authorized in a capital project budget.

Ca 3/13/13 1:22 PM

**Deleted:** ,

Sabra Briere 3/16/13 5:22 PM

**Deleted:** in or

Ca 3/13/13 12:36 PM

**Deleted:** Public art may also include performance art. The following shall not be considered works of art: mechanical or other reproductions, commercially produced items, architectural rehabilitation or historic preservation.

(4) The City Administrator shall work with the Public Art Commission to implement this section, establish appropriate design requirements for each enhanced project, and evaluate and recommend final designs and contractors for such projects.

**1:834. – Other sources of funding for public art**

(1) The City may accept monetary gifts, grants, donations, or awards for public art and may work with nonprofit or other organizations to raise funds for public art.

(2) Crowdfunding may be used to solicit donations that are intended to fund wholly or in part a specific piece of public art.

(Ord. No. 47-07, § 2, 11-5-07; Ord. No. 11-23, §

**1:835. – Funds for public art appropriated prior to July 1, 2013.**

(1) Prior to July 1, 2012, funds for public art that are included as part of a capital improvement project financed from the City's general fund may be used as part of that capital improvement project for the creation, purchase, production or other acquisition of art incorporated as a part of the capital improvement project, including art located on the site where the project is located. New capital improvement projects financed on or after July 1, 2012, from the City's general fund shall not be subject to the requirements of this subsection (1).

(2) Prior to July 1, 2012, funds for public art that are included as part of a capital improvement project financed from the City's general fund may instead be pooled in a separate public art fund within the General Fund. New capital improvement projects financed on or after July 1, 2012, from the City's general fund shall not be subject to the requirements of this subsection (2). Any funds in this pooled public art fund as of June 30, 2012, that are not allocated on or before June 30, 2015, shall be returned to general fund.

(3) Funds for public art that are included as part of a capital improvement project financed from a City fund other than the City's general fund shall be accounted for within that fund and may be used as part of that capital improvement project for the creation, purchase, production or other acquisition of art incorporated as a part of the capital improvement project, including art located on the site where the project is located.

(4) Funds for public art that are included as part of a capital improvement project financed from a City fund other than the City's general fund may instead be pooled in a separate public art fund within that fund. Public art funds that are held within a city fund other

Ca 3/13/13 1:26 PM

**Comment:** Section revised to reflect no internal fund for public art. Section may no longer be necessary given 1:831 and 1:838(2)(E)

Ca 3/13/13 12:43 PM

**Deleted:** (a) - *The Art in Public Places Trust Fund.* There is hereby created an art in public places trust. The City Administrator shall create a special revenue fund that is authorized to accept the Ann Arbor Public Art Fund for the purpose of accepting monetary gifts, grants and donations, and awards made to the city for art in public places. All City for public art. Monetary gifts, grants, donations, or awards may be made for a specific piece of public art or to support a specific public art project, subject to acceptance by City Council. All monetary appropriations, gifts, grants and awards of money accepted by the City for art in public places shall be placed in the Ann Arbor Public Art Fund deposited in an interest bearing account entitled the City of Ann Arbor Art in Public Places Trust Fund Account, which.

... [1]

Ca 3/13/13 12:46 PM

**Deleted:** (3)

Ca 3/13/13 12:45 PM

**Deleted:** to the Ann Arbor Public Art Fund as well as to solicit donations

than the general fund shall be expended only on projects that are related to the purposes of that fund.

(5) Funds in pooled public art funds may be used for the creation, purchase, production or other acquisition of art for display in public spaces or facilities; for extraordinary maintenance, repair or refurbishment, including structural reconstruction, and for relocation, alteration and removal of public art.

(6) Funds appropriated for public art as part of a budget that is effective prior to July 1, 2013, including pooled funds and funds appropriated for art components of specific capital improvement projects, shall be expended according to the provisions of this section. Funds appropriated for public art as part of a budget that is effective on or after July 1, 2013 shall not be subject to the provisions of this section.

(Ord. No. 47-07, § 2, 11-5-07; Ord. No. 11-23, § 1, 12-5-11)

### 1:836. - Disbursement of public art funds.

(1) Funds for public art that are included as part of an enhanced project or otherwise allocated for public art, and which are financed from a City fund other than the City's general fund, shall be expended only on projects that are related to the purposes of that City fund. (2) Contracts, including but not limited to those for the creation, production, purchase or other acquisition of public art, and to install, maintain, alter, repair, refurbish, relocate or remove public art, shall be processed and approved in accordance with all applicable City requirements.

(Ord. No. 47-07, § 2, 11-5-07; Ord. No. 11-23, § 1, 12-5-11)

### 1:837. - Ownership and maintenance of work.

(1) No work of art shall be considered for acquisition under this chapter without an estimate for future maintenance costs.

(2) Routine maintenance of public art shall be provided for and funded by the service area responsible for maintenance of the facility or space where the art is located. Routine maintenance shall include periodic cleaning, regular mechanical maintenance, operational costs, and other necessary upkeep resulting from normal use. Funds for extraordinary maintenance or refurbishment, including structural reconstruction, shall be drawn from pooled art funds, donations or grants, or such other funds as City Council may appropriate. No extraordinary maintenance, repair, relocation or alteration of public art shall be undertaken without prior recommendation by or consultation with the oversight body.

(3) All art acquired pursuant to this chapter shall be the sole property of the City unless an alternative arrangement is recommended by the oversight body and approved by City Council.

(4) All temporary art shall remain the property of that person or those persons who have created the art or offered it for display.

(Ord. No. 47-07, § 2, 11-5-07)

Ca 3/13/13 12:51 PM

**Comment:** Revised to reflect no internal art fund.

Ca 3/13/13 12:50 PM

**Deleted:** [(1) - Funds for public art that are included as part of a capital improvement project or that are in a pooled public art fund may be used for the purposes identified in [Section 1:834](#) -

Ca 3/13/13 12:50 PM

**Deleted:** -

(4)(2) - Funds from the Public Art Trust Fund Ann Arbor Public Art Fund may be used to select, installfor: -

(A) The design, production, installation, and maintainmaintenance of permanent or temporary public art. -

(B) Monies may be used in accordance with the requirements of this section for allNecessary City administrative costs associated with acquiring, and commissioning art for public places and managing the City's public art, including costs for administration, travel, training, postage, printing, grants match, and education workshops. These costs Administrative expenditures may not exceed 20 percent of the totalannual budget for the fund. Bond funds shall be appropriated and accounted for in the bond capital project accounts. Any gifts, grants and awards received subject to a condition shall be expended strictly in accordance with that condition. -

(5) - The interest earned on funds in the Public Art Trust Fund may be used for performance art. -

(6)(3)

Ca 3/13/13 12:54 PM

**Deleted:** the Ann Arbor Public Art Fund,

1:838. - Oversight body.

- (1) The oversight body shall be the Ann Arbor Public Art Commission as established by [Section 1:238](#) of [Chapter 8](#)
- (2) The oversight body shall:
  - (A) Promulgate guidelines, subject to the approval of City Council, to implement the provisions of this chapter, including procedures for soliciting and selecting public art and for determining suitable locations for public art;
  - (B) By [February 1](#) of each year, submit to City Council a plan detailing potential projects and desirable goals to be pursued in the next fiscal year, [including enhanced projects and any proposed expenditure of donated, grant, or other funds](#);
  - (C) Work with City staff to determine which capital improvement projects are appropriate for designation as an enhanced project and what type and amount of public art may be appropriate for such projects;
  - (D) Make recommendations, subject to the approval of the City Administrator, regarding disbursement of public art funds to acquire, produce, install, maintain, alter, relocate or remove public art;
  - (E) Raise funds above and beyond the funds for public art that are included as part of an enhanced project, interact with donors of funds or art works on behalf of the City, and foster public/private partnerships to support public art. Mechanisms for fund raising may include but are not limited to crowdfunding, grants, and gifts from corporations, foundations, and individuals;
- (G) Promote awareness of public art;
- (H) Present an annual report to City Council within 60 days after the end of each fiscal year containing:
  - (i) A report on the status of all public art incorporated into or funded by capital improvement projects in progress or completed during the preceding fiscal year;
  - (ii) A maintenance report on each work of public art presently under City management detailing maintenance costs for the preceding fiscal year, anticipated maintenance costs for the next fiscal year, and any significant future maintenance concerns, including prioritized recommendations for the maintenance, repair or renovation of particular works;
  - (iii) A review of the City's public art with regard to the purposes stated in this chapter;
  - (iv) A report on the oversight body's efforts to promote awareness of public art;
  - (v) A report on donations of art and where such art was placed;
  - (vi) A report on additional funds raised and how such funds were used;and

Ca 3/13/13 1:27 PM  
**Comment:** Revised according to comments at last meeting. Given the ongoing nature of the proposed new funding, Council may wish to combine this report with the report required under subsection H.  
Ca 3/13/13 1:15 PM  
**Deleted:** April

Ca 3/13/13 1:20 PM  
**Comment:** Revised to reflect no internal art fund.  
Ca 3/13/13 1:19 PM  
**Deleted:** (F) . Make an annual  
Ca 3/13/13 1:19 PM  
**Deleted:** determination that recommendation as to whether any interest income generated by the Art in Public Places Trust Fund Ann Arbor Public Art Fund will should be reinvested or allocated for a specific use.;

(vii) Any other matter of substantial financial or public importance relating to the public art in the City.

(I) Perform any related duty delegated by City Council;

(J) Provide advice to and assist both potential donors of art and other governmental entities regarding possible public locations for placement of art when such art cannot be placed on any City property or incorporated into a capital project of the City;

(K) For art proposed under this chapter, seek public input through the City's public engagement process. This process may include, but is not limited to, electronic messages to registered neighborhood associations, public meetings, forums, workshops online or other surveys, and A2 Open City Hall; and

(L) For architectural enhancements proposed under this chapter, work collaboratively with planning staff, project management staff, systems planning staff, the City Administrator, and the Chief Financial Officer, as appropriate, to develop concepts for those enhancements, which shall be submitted to City Council as part of the Capital Improvement budget process.

(3) Upon request, the City Administrator shall provide the oversight body with information regarding the authorized capital projects budget for that fiscal year, including information regarding the dollar amounts included in enhanced projects for public art; and information regarding the dollar amounts available in any other public art funding sources,

(Ord. No. 47-07, § 2, 11-5-07)

Ca 3/13/13 1:18 PM

**Deleted:** the Ann Arbor Public Art Fund

Ca 3/13/13 1:18 PM

**Deleted:** and any pooled public art funds